The end-users’ perceptions of test content: Is it working?

Workshop

Angela Garcia
Did you study English to prepare for the test?

- Yes, I took an Aviation English Course / private classes: 918 (53.9%)
- Yes, I studied Aviation English by myself: 506 (29.7%)
- No: 202 (11.9%)
- Other: 77 (4.5%)
Has the implementation of SDEA encouraged you to improve your English?

- The implementation of SDEA encouraged me a lot to improve my English proficiency: 23.5% (275)
- The implementation of SDEA encouraged me a little bit to improve my English proficiency: 6.9% (81)
- The implementation of SDEA did not encourage me to improve my English proficiency: 19.7% (231)
- I already wanted to improve my English proficiency before SDEA: 3.6% (42)
- I do not need to improve my English proficiency because I am already proficient: 2.2% (26)
- I don't think I need to improve my English proficiency because I don't intend to fly internationally: 0.3% (4)
- Other: 5.8% (68)

Survey Results
In your opinion, what has been the impact of the implementation of SDEA on communications safety?
In your opinion, does the test assess the abilities described in (a), (b), (c), (d) and (e)?

ICAO has determined that an applicant for a licence or a licence holder shall demonstrate, in a manner acceptable to the licensing authority, compliance with the holistic descriptors.

**Holistic Descriptors:**

Proficient speakers shall:

a) communicate effectively in voice-only (telephone/radiotelephone) and in face-to-face situations;
b) communicate on common, concrete and work-related topics with accuracy and clarity;
c) use appropriate communicative strategies to exchange messages and to recognize and resolve misunderstandings (e.g. to check, confirm, or clarify information) in a general or work-related context;
d) handle successfully and with relative ease the linguistic challenges presented by a complication or unexpected turn of events that occurs within the context of a routine work situation or communicative task with which they are otherwise familiar; and
e) use a dialect or accent which is intelligible to the aeronautical community.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Fully</th>
<th>Greatly</th>
<th>Partially</th>
<th>Little</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>(a)</td>
<td>19,92%</td>
<td>52,17%</td>
<td>20,58%</td>
<td>4,67%</td>
<td>2,00%</td>
<td>0,67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(b)</td>
<td>18,92%</td>
<td>51,25%</td>
<td>23,25%</td>
<td>3,67%</td>
<td>2,25%</td>
<td>0,67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e)</td>
<td>17,67%</td>
<td>50,83%</td>
<td>23,17%</td>
<td>5,25%</td>
<td>2,42%</td>
<td>0,67%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(d)</td>
<td>17,58%</td>
<td>47,42%</td>
<td>25,67%</td>
<td>5,50%</td>
<td>3,25%</td>
<td>0,58%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>(e)</td>
<td>16,17%</td>
<td>43,25%</td>
<td>25,92%</td>
<td>7,08%</td>
<td>5,92%</td>
<td>1,67%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Overall, do you think SDEA’s content is relevant to the purpose of evaluating pilots’ plain English in the context of pilot/air traffic controller communications?

- Yes, almost always: 265 (22.27%)
- Yes, most of the time: 587 (50.60%)
- Partially: 211 (17.06%)
- No, little: 69 (5.97%)
- No, almost never: 36 (3.50%)
- Not sure: 4 (0.60%)
Overall, do you think SDEA’s tasks are appropriate for the purpose of evaluating pilots’ plain English in the context of pilot/air traffic controller communications?
In general terms, do you consider the test to be adequate for testing the six Language Proficiency skills according to the ICAO rating scale?
### Survey Results

Do you consider the test to be appropriate to measure each of the six ICAO Language Proficiency skills?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Skills</th>
<th>Yes, always or almost always</th>
<th>Yes, most of the time</th>
<th>Partially</th>
<th>No, little</th>
<th>No, almost never</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Pronunciation</td>
<td>22.10%</td>
<td>49.60%</td>
<td>19.90%</td>
<td>5.10%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Structure</td>
<td>17.40%</td>
<td>53.10%</td>
<td>20.60%</td>
<td>5.50%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
<td>1.40%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Vocabulary</td>
<td>23.40%</td>
<td>53.90%</td>
<td>16.60%</td>
<td>3.60%</td>
<td>1.00%</td>
<td>1.60%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fluency</td>
<td>23.40%</td>
<td>51.90%</td>
<td>17.90%</td>
<td>4.10%</td>
<td>1.10%</td>
<td>1.10%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Comprehension</td>
<td>26.00%</td>
<td>52.60%</td>
<td>14.90%</td>
<td>4.00%</td>
<td>1.20%</td>
<td>1.20%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Interactions</td>
<td>21.40%</td>
<td>49.00%</td>
<td>19.10%</td>
<td>4.50%</td>
<td>1.20%</td>
<td>1.20%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Counts:
- Pronunciation: 297 666 267 69 25 19
- Structure: 219 668 259 69 25 18
- Vocabulary: 289 665 205 44 18 12
- Fluency: 286 634 219 50 20 13
- Comprehension: 315 637 181 49 15 14
- Interactions: 258 592 231 54 24 14
In your opinion, how much can a pilot’s pronunciation be assessed in each part of the test?

A pilot’s pronunciation can be fully/greatly/moderately/little/not at all assessed in Part 1/2/3/4 of the test.
In your opinion, how much of the “structure” criterion, in accordance with the ICAO rating scale, can be assessed in each part of the test?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Fully</th>
<th>Greatly</th>
<th>Moderately</th>
<th>Little</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part 1</td>
<td>14,71%</td>
<td>51,83%</td>
<td>23,29%</td>
<td>6,52%</td>
<td>1,67%</td>
<td>1,99%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>185</td>
<td>652</td>
<td>293</td>
<td>82</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>25</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 2</td>
<td>9,14%</td>
<td>49,28%</td>
<td>28,30%</td>
<td>7,95%</td>
<td>3,18%</td>
<td>2,15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>115</td>
<td>620</td>
<td>356</td>
<td>100</td>
<td>40</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 3</td>
<td>10,02%</td>
<td>50,32%</td>
<td>28,14%</td>
<td>6,92%</td>
<td>7,54%</td>
<td>2,07%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>126</td>
<td>633</td>
<td>354</td>
<td>87</td>
<td>32</td>
<td>26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 4</td>
<td>15,02%</td>
<td>52,94%</td>
<td>21,86%</td>
<td>6,12%</td>
<td>1,91%</td>
<td>2,15%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>189</td>
<td>666</td>
<td>275</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>24</td>
<td>27</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A pilot’s “structure” can be fully/greatly/moderately/little/not at all assessed in accordance with the ICAO rating scale in Part 1/2/3/4 of the test.*
In your opinion, how much of the “vocabulary” criterion, in accordance with the ICAO rating scale, can be assessed in each part of the test?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Fully</th>
<th>Greatly</th>
<th>Moderately</th>
<th>Little</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part 1</td>
<td>17,36%</td>
<td>50,93%</td>
<td>22,87%</td>
<td>5,76%</td>
<td>1,62%</td>
<td>1,46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>214</td>
<td>628</td>
<td>282</td>
<td>71</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 2</td>
<td>12,57%</td>
<td>49,88%</td>
<td>28,06%</td>
<td>5,84%</td>
<td>2,11%</td>
<td>1,54%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>155</td>
<td>615</td>
<td>346</td>
<td>72</td>
<td>26</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 3</td>
<td>14,27%</td>
<td>50,45%</td>
<td>26,44%</td>
<td>5,35%</td>
<td>2,03%</td>
<td>1,46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>176</td>
<td>622</td>
<td>326</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>25</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 4</td>
<td>20,60%</td>
<td>52,55%</td>
<td>19,55%</td>
<td>4,38%</td>
<td>1,46%</td>
<td>1,46%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>234</td>
<td>648</td>
<td>241</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A pilot’s “vocabulary” can be fully/greatly/moderately/little/not at all assessed in accordance with the ICAO rating scale in Part 1/2/3/4 of the test.
In your opinion, how much of the “fluency” criterion, in accordance with the ICAO rating scale, can be assessed in each part of the test?

A pilot’s “fluency” can be **fully/greatly/moderately/little/not at all** assessed in accordance with the ICAO rating scale in Part 1/2/3/4 of the test.
In your opinion, how much of the “comprehension” criterion, in accordance with the ICAO rating scale, can be assessed in each part of the test?

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Fully</th>
<th>Greatly</th>
<th>Moderately</th>
<th>Little</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part 1</td>
<td>15.69%</td>
<td>51.20%</td>
<td>22.79%</td>
<td>7.02%</td>
<td>1.82%</td>
<td>1.49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>190</td>
<td>620</td>
<td>276</td>
<td>85</td>
<td>22</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 2</td>
<td>22.71%</td>
<td>52.68%</td>
<td>16.93%</td>
<td>4.79%</td>
<td>1.32%</td>
<td>1.57%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>275</td>
<td>638</td>
<td>205</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 3</td>
<td>24.19%</td>
<td>51.45%</td>
<td>16.52%</td>
<td>4.87%</td>
<td>1.49%</td>
<td>1.49%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>293</td>
<td>623</td>
<td>200</td>
<td>59</td>
<td>18</td>
<td>18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 4</td>
<td>14.70%</td>
<td>47.73%</td>
<td>22.38%</td>
<td>9.50%</td>
<td>4.05%</td>
<td>1.65%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>178</td>
<td>578</td>
<td>271</td>
<td>115</td>
<td>49</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

A pilot’s “comprehension” can be fully/greatly/moderately/little/not at all assessed in accordance with the ICAO rating scale in Part 1/2/3/4 of the test.
In your opinion, how much of the “interactions” criterion, in accordance with the ICAO rating scale, can be assessed in each part of the test?

### Survey Results

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Part</th>
<th>Fully</th>
<th>Greatly</th>
<th>Moderately</th>
<th>Little</th>
<th>Not at all</th>
<th>Not sure</th>
<th>Total</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Part 1</td>
<td>17.23%</td>
<td>47.31%</td>
<td>25.10%</td>
<td>6.38%</td>
<td>2.40%</td>
<td>1.57%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>208</td>
<td>571</td>
<td>303</td>
<td>77</td>
<td>29</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 2</td>
<td>16.16%</td>
<td>49.54%</td>
<td>24.69%</td>
<td>5.47%</td>
<td>2.57%</td>
<td>1.57%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>195</td>
<td>598</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>66</td>
<td>31</td>
<td>19</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 3</td>
<td>15.08%</td>
<td>49.63%</td>
<td>24.69%</td>
<td>6.05%</td>
<td>2.90%</td>
<td>1.66%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>182</td>
<td>599</td>
<td>298</td>
<td>73</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Part 4</td>
<td>13.09%</td>
<td>45.15%</td>
<td>26.59%</td>
<td>8.12%</td>
<td>5.39%</td>
<td>1.66%</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>158</td>
<td>543</td>
<td>321</td>
<td>58</td>
<td>35</td>
<td>20</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*A pilot’s “structure” can be fully/greatly/moderately/little/not at all assessed in accordance with the ICAO rating scale in Part 1/2/3/4 of the test.*
How much confidence do you have in the result of the test?

How much confidence do you think pilots have in the result of the test?

How much confidence do you think pilots have in ANAC as the Civil Aviation Authority in general?
Overall, do you think the test reflects the communicative abilities you need when phraseology is not sufficient for radiotelephony communications?
The main objective of the ICAO LPRs is to assess pilots’ ability to communicate effectively with the air traffic controllers in non-routine situations using plain English.

Survey Results

How well does the test meet this requirement?

- Completely: 14.60% (227)
- Very well: 46.10% (715)
- Moderately: 27.50% (427)
- A little: 6.80% (106)
- It hardly meets it: 2.40% (38)
- Not sure: 2.30% (39)

0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100%
Part 1: Aviation Topics

7 general questions related to aviation, to the candidate’s professional experience or daily activities as a pilot.
The main objective of the ICAO LPRs is to assess pilots’ ability to communicate effectively with the air traffic controllers in non-routine situations using plain English.

**Survey Results**

How well does Part 1 meet this requirement?

- Completely: 17.80% (212)
- Very well: 45.50% (541)
- Partially: 23.20% (276)
- A little: 7.70% (92)
- It hardly meets it: 4.50% (54)
- Not sure: 1.20% (14)

0% 10% 20% 30% 40% 50% 60% 70% 80% 90% 100%
Part 2: Interacting as a Pilot

Role play: The candidate interacts with the Air Traffic Control as a pilot in 3 different situations. Each situation consists of 2 recordings.
The main objective of the ICAO LPRs is to assess pilots’ ability to communicate effectively with the air traffic controllers in non-routine situations using plain English.

Survey Results

How well does Part 2 meet this requirement?

- Completely: 2120% (252)
- Very well: 5110% (608)
- Partially: 1980% (236)
- A little: 420% (50)
- It hardly meets it: 100% (31)
- Not sure: 260% (12)
Part 3: Unexpected Situations

Task: The candidate listens to 3 different communications between a pilot and an air traffic controller. He/She has to report everything he/she understood and answer a question related to the audio. Then, in the end of Part 3, they have to compare the 3 situations in terms of severity.
The main objective of the ICAO LPRs is to assess pilots’ ability to communicate effectively with the air traffic controllers in non-routine situations using plain English.

Survey Results

How well does Part 3 meet this requirement?

- Completely: 23.90% (284)
- Very well: 49.50% (588)
- Partially: 19.60% (233)
- A little: 4.00% (47)
- It hardly meets it: 0.90% (11)
- Not sure: 2.20% (26)
Part 4: Picture Description and Discussion

Task: The candidate needs to describe a picture and answer three questions related to it.
The main objective of the ICAO LPRs is to assess pilots’ ability to communicate effectively with the air traffic controllers in non-routine situations using plain English.

How well does Part 4 meet this requirement?

- Completely: 18.30% (217)
- Very well: 45% (535)
- Partially: 24.10% (286)
- A little: 6.70% (80)
- It hardly meets it: 1.00% (59)
- Not sure: 5.00% (12)
**Survey Results**

*Main complaints:*
- Price: too expensive
- Few accredited institutions
- How long it takes for them to know their test result
- Not possible to reach level 6
- Some candidates seem not to trust accredited examiners
- They think the reassessment period is too short

*Subjective rating*
- “The rating is subjective. Scoring should be completely automated.”
- “SDEA is excellent. The problem is the rating.”
- “I believe that the pilot community in general does not prepare for the test adequately and does not have the necessary English knowledge and blame their low performance on the assessors.”

- The test should not focus too much on structure
- The test is not suitable for helicopter pilots
- Candidates should be allowed to listen to the audios as many times as they want
  - “If we were in a real situation we would ask for repetition as many times as we wanted.”
Main suggestions:

- Most important parts of the test: Parts 2 and 3
  
  “I believe SDEA should focus on the English used in communications between pilots and air traffic controllers. Talking about your background and describing pictures are more related to general English and I don’t think they are useful. Parts 2 and 3 are the ones which are relevant to our job.”

- To include live interactions

- To do the test in simulators
I think the test is good the way it is done today.

After the test was revised and updated, it became more operational. I like it a lot.

In general, the test is very good. It is simple and to the point. It has improved a lot. The only problem, in my opinion, is that it is too expensive.

SDEA has been extremely important for pilots to keep studying English.

The test was well designed and meets pilots’ needs.

SDEA has the same quality standards as RELTA. It is well conducted and it involves a wide variety of situations.

I like the test content and tasks. I wouldn’t change it much. I just think it is expensive and I think the grades tend to be low.

I really like the current test.

Usually rumors and untruths about the test are disseminated by the pilots who do not pass the test and do not recognize that the best way to reach the minimum grade is studying the language.

Congratulations! I’ve made some flights to the USA and, being a level 4, I noticed I had a few difficulties. I was totally operational.
Negative feedback

- The current test is not efficient.
- Most of the time the interactions are not similar to my work, because I am a helicopter pilot.
- The test should be more interactive.
- It should be more practical.
- I believe the test includes just a few examples of situations we may face when flying internationally. I don’t think it’s enough.

- The test focus more on how much the pilot knows about the test itself, not English.
- The test focus too much on structure and not on the ability of the pilot to communicate. In general, pilots classify SDEA as a test for teachers and not for pilots.
- The Agency is just demanding, but is not helping.
- It does not reflect real communications.
- It’s cultural, people are always going to complain.
I see pilots are much better prepared than air traffic controllers.

We have been facing reckless air traffic controllers.

The test is appropriate. Some pilots complain just because they wanted to be a level 4 but they didn’t make enough effort.

I listen to foreign pilots flying in Brazil and their pronunciation is horrible. How did they get a level 4?

The test obligates pilots to keep updated with the required language proficiency, what makes aviation safer, as safety depends a lot on effective communications.

The lack of standardization of American air traffic controllers is a problem. I’ve had issues with them twice.

Why don’t the USA and Singapore adopt this ICAO requirement?
1) How relevant is each part of the test to the pilots’ job?

2) What is working? What is not working?

3) Is there a relationship between pilots’ attitude (the survey results) and what we can see in terms of test design, test tasks etc.? What might be the reasons why the pilots have responded the way they did?

4) How can SDEA be improved?

You are welcome to share your experience: 5) What are your perceptions of test content in relation to the test you work with or you are most familiar with?
We are developing test versions for helicopter pilots;  

- Part 1: 3 questions (follow up questions).
- Part 2: 5 situations
- Part 4: variety of pictures

We are developing a software (SySDEA) that will administer the test and randomly create test versions.

- New task: live role play.
Any questions?